March 25, 2014

Howard Bauchner, MD
Editor-in Chief, JAMA
330 N. Wabash Ave
Chicago, IL 60611-5885

Re: Association of Testosterone Therapy With Mortality, Myocardial Infarction, and Stroke in Men With Low Testosterone Levels by Vigen et al

Dear Dr. Bauchner,

In the best interests of medical science, we write to recommend retraction of the article by Vigen et al published in JAMA Nov 13, 2013 (1).

As physicians and scientists interested in the testosterone field, we welcome any new addition to the scientific literature that furthers knowledge in this important area. However, there must be a reasonable minimum standard for the quality of publications such that the reported science is credible. The publication of results that are unlikely to be accurate is a disservice to the scientific community and the literature. Due to new revelations, we believe the article by Vigen et al no longer meets the acceptable minimum standard.

The credibility of this article was initially compromised by its original mis-reporting of data, requiring a post-publication revision on January 15, 2014 (2). Now it has been revealed via a new published correction that there were major errors in values presented in the text and figure. The quality and magnitude of these errors indicate gross data mismanagement and contamination, to a degree that the reported results are no longer reliable. Our recommendation for retraction follows guidelines published by The Committee On Publication Ethics (COPE) (3), which has stated that journal editors should consider retracting a publication if “they have clear evidence the results are unreliable, either as a result of misconduct (e.g. data fabrication), or honest error (e.g., miscalculation or experimental error).”

On March 4, 2014 JAMA published several letters regarding this article (4), the authors’ reply (5), and also a new correction (6). In response to the criticism that the authors had improperly excluded 1132 men from analysis who had received a testosterone prescription after experiencing an event (MI or stroke), the authors indicated they had revisited this value presented in the text and Figure 1, and had made “an incorrect notation” regarding this value. They now assert the numbers of men excluded for this reason was 128, not 1132. This is an 89% error rate, involving >1000 individuals. The number of men now excluded due to missing coronary anatomy increased from 397 to 1301, a 69% error rate, involving 904 individuals. Astonishingly, 100 women were now identified among the original group of 1132 individuals, meaning that one out of eleven “men” in the study were actually women.

It is impossible for the scientific community to have any confidence in the results of a study when there have been unrecognized errors involving more than a thousand individuals, and nearly 10% of a dataset is populated
by the wrong gender. The study by Vigen et al is no longer credible. In the interests of science and the medical literature, we urge you to retract this article immediately.

References


6. Correction: Incorrect Number of Excluded Patients Reported in the Text and Figure. JAMA 2014; 311 (9):967.

Respectfully,

Abraham Morgentaler, MD, for the Androgen Study Group

And signed by the following Professional Societies and Individual physicians:

**Professional Societies:**

American Society for Men’s Health

International Society for Sexual Medicine

International Society for the Study of the Aging Male

Russian Society for Men’s Health

Sexual Medicine Society of North America

Sociedade Latinoamericana de Medicina Sexual

Society for the Study of Androgen Deficiency
Individuals:

P Ganesan Adaikan PhD, DSc
Research Professor
Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology,
National University of Singapore
Singapore, Singapore

Prof. Anna Maria Aloisi, MD, PhD
University of Siena
Sienna, Italy

Stanley E. Althof, Ph.D.
Emeritus Professor
Case Western Reserve University School of Medicine
Executive Director, Center for Marital and Sexual Health of South Florida
West Palm Beach, Florida, USA
Dr Edouard Amar
Uroandrologist
Paris, France

Gerald L. Andriole, MD
Royce Distinguished Professor and Chief of Urologic Surgery
Washington University School of Medicine
St. Louis, MO, USA

Stefan Arver, MD, PhD
Director, Associate Professor
Center for Andrology and Sexual Medicine
Karolinska University Hospital
Department of Medicine/Huddinge
Karolinska Institutet
Stockholm, Sweden

Prof. Antonio Aversa
Professor of Endocrinology
Dept. Experimental Medicine
Sapienza University of Rome
Rome, Italy

Harvey Bartnof, MD
Founder and Medical Director at California Longevity & Vitality Medical Institute
Visiting Professor at Liaoning Medical College and Shenyang Medical College, China.
San Francisco, CA, USA

Dr. Neil Baum,
Clinical Associate Professor of Urology
Tulane University School of Medicine
New Orleans, LA USA

Dr Richard Bebb MD, ABIM, FRCPC
Clinical Associate Professor
Division of Endocrinology and Metabolism
University of British Columbia
Medical Director TARC Clinic
Vancouver, BC, Canada

Edgardo F Becher, MD PhD
Professor of Urology
University of Buenos Aires
Immediate Past-President,
International Society for Sexual Medicine ISSM
Director, Centro de Urologia CDU
Buenos Aires, Argentina

Nelson Bennett, Jr., MD
Director, Sexual Medicine and Surgery
Lahey Hospital and Medical Center, Burlington, MA, USA

Carlo Bettocchi
Chief of Andrology Unit
University of Bari, Italy

Trinity J. Bivalacqua MD PhD
Associate Professor of Urology, Surgery, and Oncology
Director of Urologic Oncology
Associate Program Director Urologic Oncology Fellowship
Co-Director Bladder Cancer Multidisciplinary Clinic
Sidney Kimmel Comprehensive Cancer Center (SKCCC)
Johns Hopkins Medical Institutions and The James Buchanan Brady Urological Institute
Baltimore, MD, USA

Valentina Boddi, MD
Endocrinologist
EAA Clinical Andrologist
Sexual Medicine and Andrology Unit
Department of Experimental, Clinical and Biomedical Sciences
University of Florence
Florence, Italy

William O Brant, MD FACS FECSM
University of Utah
Center for Reconstructive Urology and Men’s Health
Salt Lake City, UT USA

Gerald Brock MD, FRCSC
Professor of Surgery
Urology Program Director
Western University
Vice President of Education, Canadian Urological Association
London, Ontario, Canada

Gregory A. Broderick MD
Professor of Urology
Mayo Clinic College of Medicine
Jacksonville, FL, USA

Arthur Burnett, MD
President, Sexual Medicine Society of North America
Patrick C. Walsh Distinguished Professor of Urology, Cellular and Molecular Medicine
Johns Hopkins Medicine, Baltimore, MD, USA
Dr Jacques Buvat
President Socièté Francophone de Médecine Sexuelle (SFMS)
Past President International Society of Sexual Medicine (ISSM)
Centre ETPARP (CETPARP)
Lille, France

Rafael Carrion, MD
Associate Professor of Urology
Program Director
Director of Research
University of South Florida School of Medicine

Culley Carson, MD
Chief of Urology
University of North Carolina Hospitals
Distinguished Professor of Urology
Professor of Surgery
University of North Carolina
Chapel Hill, NC, USA

Prof Malcolm Carruthers, MD,FRCPath.
Centre for Men’s Health, Harley Street
Alzheimer’s Disease Research unit, Edith Cowan University, Western Australia.
Member British Cardiovascular Society
London, UK

Adolfo Casabé MD
Medical Director of IME
Chief of Sexual Medical Department
Hospital Durand
Buenos Aires, Argentina

Professor Kevin Channer
Consultant Cardiologist and Hon Prof Cardiovascular Medicine
Sheffield Hallam University
Sheffield, UK

Brian Christine, MD
Director of Erectile Restoration and Prosthetic Urology
Urology Centers of Alabama
Birmingham, Alabama, USA

William Conners, MD
Men’s Health Boston
Clinical Instructor in Urology
Harvard Medical School
Boston, MA, USA

Giovanni Corona MD, PhD
Endocrinology Unit, Maggiore-Bellaria Hospital,
Medical Department, Azienda-Usl Bologna,
Bologna, Italy

E. David Crawford, MD
Professor of Surgery/Urology/Radiation Oncology
Head Urologic Oncology
E. David Crawford Endowed Chair in Urologic Oncology
University of Colorado, Denver
Aurora, CO, USA

Carlos Teodósio Da Ros, MD
Center of Andrology and Urology
Porto Alegre, RS, Brazil

Dr John Dean MBBS MFMLM FRCGP FECSM
Past-President International Society of Sexual Medicine
Clinical Director, Gender & Sexual Medicine, Devon Partnership NHS Trust
Sexual Physician, St Peter's Andrology Centre
London, UK

Prof. dr. F.M.J. Debruyne, MD, PhD
Emeritus Professor and Chairmen
Department of Urology, University Medical Centre
Nijmegen, The Netherlands
Past Secretary-General of the European Association of Urology
Medical Director Andros Men’s and Gynos Women’s Health Institutes
Arnhem, The Netherlands

Evgeniy Efremov, MD, PhD
Russian Research Institute for Urology
Moscow, Russia

Stacy Elliott, MD
Clinical Professor, Departments of Psychiatry and Urologic Sciences
University of British Columbia
Vancouver, BC Canada

Amr El Meliegy, MD.
Professor of Andrology, Cairo University
Past president, Middle East Society for Sexual Medicine
Cairo, Egypt

Ahmed El-Sakka, MSc, MD, FUCSF, JMHPE
Prof. of Urology, Suez Canal University, Egypt
Fellowship, University of California-SF, USA
President of Middle East Society for Sexual Medicine (MESSM)
Fernando Nestor Facio Jr - M.D. PhD.
Professor, Division of Urology
Medical School S.J.Rio Preto- FAMERP
Brazil

Geraldo Eduardo Faria , MD
Rio Claro, Brazil

Robert A. Feldman, MD
Urology Specialists
Medical Director, Connecticut Clinical Research Center
Middlebury, CT, USA

Kevin Flinn, RN
Men’s Health Boston
Brookline, MA, USA

Gianni Forti, MD
Full Professor of Endocrinology University of Florence,
Florence, Italy

Eduard García Cruz,
Urology and Man’s Health Unit, Urology Department,
Hospital Clínica de Barcelona
Barcelona, Spain
Ed R Gatchalian,MD
University of the Philippines College of Medicine
Manila, Philippines
Dr. Bruno Giammusso
Director, Department of Andrology
Policlinico Morgagni . Catania
Catania, Italy

Sidney Glina
President, SLAMS (Latin American Society of Sexual Medicine)
Professor, Department of Urology
Faculdade de Medicina do ABC Instituto H. Ellis
São Paulo, Brazil

S Larry Goldenberg, CM, OBC, MD
Stephen A Jarislowski Chair of Urologic Sciences
Chair, Canadian Men’s Health Foundation
Vancouver, BC, Canada
Irwin Goldstein, MD
Director, Sexual Medicine, Alvarado Hospital, San Diego, CA
Clinical Professor of Surgery, University of California at San Diego
Editor in Chief, The Journal of Sexual Medicine
San Diego, CA, USA

Neil Goodman, MD, FACE
Professor of Medicine
Voluntary Faculty
University of Miami Miller School of Medicine
Chair, Reproductive Hormone Committee
American Society of Clinical Endocrinologists (AACE)
Miami, FL, USA

Louis J Gooren, MD, PhD
Emeritus Professor of Endocrinology
VU University Medical Center
Amsterdam, The Netherlands
AndroConsult
ChiangMai, Thailand

Prof. Alessandra Graziottin, MD
Director, Center of Gynecology and Medical Sexology
Founder and Chairman, Graziottin Foundation
Milan, Italy

Andre T Guay MD, FACP, FACE, IF
Director, Center For Sexual Function / Endocrinology
Lahey Clinic Northshore, Peabody, MA
Clinical Professor of Medicine (Endocrinology), Tufts University School of Medicine
Boston, MA, USA

Dariya Gusakova, MD
Department of Andrology and Reproductive Medicine
Russian Research Center for Urology
Moscow, Russia

Geoffrey Hackett MD
Professor of Men’s Health and Diabetes
University of Bedfordshire, UK
Consultant in Urology and Sexual Medicine
Heartlands Hospital
Birmingham, UK

Dr. med. Ahmad Haider
Bremerhaven, Germany

Lawrence S. Hakim, MD
Chairman, Department of Urology
Cleveland Clinic Florida
President-Elect, Sexual Medicine Society of North America
Weston, Florida, USA
Alfredo Halpern, MD
Professor of Endocrinology
University of S Paulo
Brazil

Michael Lützhøft Hansen, MD
Senior Consultant, Dept. of OB/GYN
Stavanger University Hospital
Stavanger, Norway

Dimitris Hatzichristou, MD
Professor of Urology
Director, Unit for the Study of Urological Diseases
Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece

Wayne J.G. Hellstrom, MD, FACS
Professor of Urology
Chief, Section of Andrology
Department of Urology
Tulane University School of Medicine

Armin E. Heufelder, MD
Professor of Internal Medicine & Endocrinology
Apl. Professor, Medical Faculty
Technical University of Munich/Germany
Mariam Hult, MD
Copenhagen, Denmark

Luca Incrocci, MD PhD
Associate Professor and Acting Head
Instructor in Surgery (Urology)
Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center
Harvard Medical School
Boston, MA, USA

Svetlana Kalinchenko
Chief Professor, Chair of Endocrinology
People's Friendship University of Russia City
Moscow, Russia

Armais Kamalov, MD, PhD
Professor of Urology
Vice-chairman, Russian Society of Urology
Corresponding Member of Russian Academy of Medical Sciences
Department of Urology and Andrology,
Moscow State University
Moscow, Russia

Bryan Kansas, MD
The Urology Team
Austin, TX, USA

Edward Karpman
Urological Surgeons of Northern California
Mountain View, CA, USA

Mohit Khera, MD, MBA, MPH
Associate Professor of Urology
Baylor College of Medicine
Houston, TX, USA

Noel N. Kim, PhD
Senior Investigator, Institute for Sexual Medicine
San Diego, CA, USA

Kyriakos E. Kypreos
Professor of Pharmacology
University of Patras
School of Health Sciences
Department of Medicine
Pharmacology Laboratory
Panepistimioupolis, Greece

Tobias S. Köhler, MD, MPH, FACS
Associate Professor
Southern Illinois University SOM

Univ.Prof.Dr. Andreas Jungwirth
Professor of Urology,
Medical University of Vienna
Chairman of the Infertility Working Group of the EAU
Board Member of the Austrian Andrological Working Group of the OEGU
EMCO Private Clinic
Bad Dürrnberg, Austria

Andrea Lenzi, MD
Chairman Section of Medical Pathophysiology, Food Science and Endocrinology
Professor and Chair of Endocrinology
Sapienza University of Rome
Rome – Italy
Peter Lim Huat Chye, MD
Senior Consultant Urological Surgeon
Hon.Professor (Urology & Andrology), HT Naval Medical School, Indonesia,
Adjunct Professor, Edith Cowan University, Australia
Visiting Consultant, Depts of Urology, KTP Hospital & Changi General Hospital
Andrology, Urology & Continence Centre, Gleneagles Hospital
Singapore

Larry Lipshultz, MD
Professor of Urology
Director, Division of Male Reproductive Medicine and Surgery
Co-director, Endocrine Forum
Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, TX

Francesco Lotti, M.D.
Endocrinologist and Andrologist
Sexual Medicine and Andrology Unit
Department of Experimental and Clinical Biomedical Sciences
University of Florence, Florence, Italy

Prof B Lunenfeld MD PhD
Prof Emeritus, Bar Ilan University
President, International Society for the Study of the Aging Male (ISSAM)
Editor in Chief, The Aging Male
Israel

Mario Maggi MD
Full Professor of Endocrinology
School of Medicine
University of Florence
Florence, Italy

Dr Christoper J Malkin
Department of Cardiology
Leeds General Infirmary
Leeds Teaching Hospitals
Leeds, UK

Professor Allan Mazur, PhD.
Syracuse University
Syracuse, NY, USA

Andrew McCullough, MD
Associate Professor of Clinical Urology
Albany Medical Center, State University of New York
Albany, NY, USA

Dr Chris G McMahon MBBS, FACHSHM
President, International Society for Sexual Medicine (ISSM)
Director, Australian Centre for Sexual Health
St Leonards, Australia

Yaroslav Melnik, MD
Russian Research Institute for Urology
Moscow, Russia

Dr. med. Andreas Meissner, MD
Clinical Andrologist (EAA) - FEBU - FECSM - Urologist
Academic Medical Center
University of Amsterdam
Department of Urology (G4-105)
Amsterdam, The Netherlands
Martin Miner MD
Co-Director, Men’s Health Center
Chief of Family and Community Medicine, Miriam Hospital
Clinical Associate Professor of Family Medicine and Urology
Warren Alpert School of Medicine
Brown University
Providence, RI, USA

Antonio Martin Morales
Urólogo, Andrólogo, Experto en Medicina Sexual (FECSM)
Director IUM
Instituto de Urología Málaga
Echegaray 4, 1º E
Malaga, Spain

Francesco Montorsi, MD
Professor and Chairman,
Department of Urology
Università Vita Salute San Raffaele
Editor Emeritus, European Urology
Milan, Italy

Alvaro Morales, MD, CM, FRCSC, FACS
Emeritus Professor of Urology
Queen’s University
Kingston, Canada

Sergio Moreno Figueroa
Chief, Urology Department Clínica
Universidad de los Andes
Santiago, Chile

Ignacio Moncada MD
Head of Urology and Andrology
Hospital la Zarzuela
Professor of Urology
Francisco de Vitoria University
Madrid, Spain

John E Morley MBBCh
Dammert Professor of Gerontology
Director of Endocrinology and Geriatrics
Editor, Journal Of the American Medical Directors Association  
St Louis University Medical School  
St Louis MO USA

George Mskhalaya, MD  
Department of Andrology and Endocrinology  
Center for Reproductive Medicine  
Moscow, Russia

John Mulhall, MD  
Incoming Editor-in-Chief, The Journal of Sexual Medicine  
Chairman, Core Curriculum Committee of the American Urological Association  
Immediate Past-President, Sexual Medicine Society of North America  
Professor, Weill Medical College of Cornell University  
Director, Sexual and Reproductive Medicine Program  
Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center  
New York, NY, USA

Alexander Müller  
Associate Professor, University of Zürich  
Chairman of the Andrology Section  
Zürich, Switzerland

Ricardo Munarriz, M.D.  
Associate Professor of Urology  
Director of the Center For Sexual Medicine  
Boston University School of Medicine  
Ajay Nehra, M.D., FACS  
Professor and Chairman  
Department of Urology  
Rush University Medical Center  
Chicago, IL, USA

Eberhard Nieschlag MD, PhD, FRCP  
Emeritus Professor of Reproductive Medicine and Andrology  
University of Münster  
Past President, European Society of Endocrinology  
Past President, European Academy of Andrology  
Past President, International Society of Andrology  
Past President, German Society of Endocrinology  
Past President, German Societies for Reproductive Medicine  
Münster, Germany
Dmitry Okhobotov, MD, PhD
Department of Urology and Andrology,
Moscow State University
Moscow, Russia

Darius A Paduch, MD, PhD
Associate Professor of Urology and Sexual Medicine
Director Sexual Health and Medicine
Weill Cornell Medical College

Eugen Plas, MD
Associate Professor of Urology
Vienna, Austria

Jean Pierre Raynaud DSc
Professor emeritus
University Pierre et Marie Curie
Paris, France

Giulia Rastrelli, MD, PhD
Department of Experimental and Clinical Biomedical Sciences
University of Florence
Florence – Italy

Ernani Luis Rhoden
Professor of Urology
Universidade Federal de Ciência da Saúde de Porto Alegre
Porto Alegre, Brazil

Miguel Rivero, MD
Past President, SLAMS (Latin American Society of Sexual Medicine)
Buenos Aires, Argentina

Prof.Dr. Thierry Roumeguère
Chef du service d'Urologie
Erasme Hospital, Brussels, Belgium

Hossein Sadeghi-Nejad, M.D., F.A.C.S.
Professor of Surgery, Division of Urology
Atif Saghir, PhD
University of Birmingham
Birmingham, UK

Joao Luiz Schiavini
Associate Professor of Urology and Andrology
Rio de Janeiro State University
Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

Claude Schulman, MD, PhD
Professor Emeritus of the University
Honorary Chairman Department Urology
University of Brussels
Editor Emeritus European Urology
Clinic E.Cavell
Brussels, Belgium

Ridwan Shabsigh, MD
Chairman, Department of Surgery
St. Barnabas Hospital, Bronx, NY, USA
Professor of clinical urology, Cornell University
New York, NY, USA
Rany Shamloul, MD
Ottawa, Canada
Ottawa Hospital Research Institute, Ottawa, Canada
Department of Andrology
Cairo University,
Cairo, Egypt

Alan W. Shindel, MD, MAS
Editor in Chief, Sexual Medicine Open Access
Chairman, Education Committee, Sexual Medicine Society of North America
Department of Urology
University of California, Davis
Sacramento, CA, USA

Frank Sommer, MD, PhD
Director of Men`s Health
University Medical Hospital
Hamburg, Germany

Richard Sylvester, ScD
Biostatistician
Brussels, Belgium

Claudio Teloken, MD
Professor of Urology at UFCSPA (Federal University)
Chairman of Andrology Section and IRB at Santa Casa Hospital
Chairman of Urology Residency Program (PREMEU) at UFCSPA
Porto Alegre, Brazil

Dr Colin Teo
Head of Urology Department
Khoo Teck Puat Hospital
Adjunct Assistant Professor
Yong Loo Lin School of Medicine, National University of Singapore
President, Society for Men’s Health, Singapore
Honorary General Secretary, Chapter of Urologists, College of Surgeons,
Singapore, Singapore

Yuliya Tishova
Associate Professor, Chair of Endocrinology
People's Friendship University of Russia
Moscow, Russia

Luiz Otavio Torres
Secretary General, International Society of Sexual Medicine
Director of International Relations, Brazilian Society of Urology
Belo Horizonte, Brazil

Abdulmaged M. Traish, MBA, Ph.D.
Professor of Biochemistry
Professor of Urology
Research Director,
Institute of Sexual Medicine
Boston University School of Medicine
Boston, MA, USA

Prof TR Trinick BSc (Hons), MB BCh BAO, FRCPath, FRCP, FRCPE, FRCPI, EurClinChem, FMLM, MD
Consultant Chemical Pathologist and General Physician
Visiting Professor, University of Ulster
Faculty of Life & Health Sciences, School of Sports Studies
Belfast, Northern Ireland, UK

Peter Veneziano-PAC
Men’s Health Boston
Brookline, MA, USA

Linda Vignozzi
Assistant Professor in Endocrinology
University of Florence,
Florence, Italy

Ronald Virag
Membre de l’Académie Nationale de Chirurgie (Frech Surgical Academy)
Winner of the Lattimer Prize, American Association of Urology
Founder of the ISIR which is now International Society for Sexual Medicine
Centre CETI
Paris, France

Charalambos Vlachopoulos
Associate Professor, Cardiovascular Diseases and Sexual Health Unit
1st Department of Cardiology
Athens Medical School
Athens, Greece

Leonid Vorslov
Professor, Chair of Endocrinology
People’s Friendship University of Russia
Moscow, Russia

Prof. Dr. Dr. Aksam A. Yassin MD PhD EdD FEBU
Chairman Institute of Urology & Andrology
Hamburg, Germany

George Yu MD
Clinical Professor of Urology
George Washington University Medical Center
Washington DC, USA

Adrian Zentner MB.BS.(Hons)DAvMed.FACAsM.
Perth Australia

Michael Zitzmann
Professor of Endocrinology and Andrology
Chief, Endocrinology Section
University Clinics of Muenster
Muenster, Germany